

# Valley County Planning and Zoning Commission

PO Box 1350 • 700 South Main Street  
Cascade, ID 83611-1350



Phone: 208-382-7115  
Email: [cherrick@valleycountyid.gov](mailto:cherrick@valleycountyid.gov)

Ken Roberts, Chairman  
Carrie Potter, Vice-Chair

Brad Mabe, Commissioner  
Ben Oyarzo, Commissioner  
Heidi Schneider, Commissioner

## MINUTES

Valley County Planning and Zoning Commission  
**November 13, 2025**  
**Valley County Court House - Cascade, Idaho**  
**PUBLIC HEARING - 6:00 p.m.**

**A. OPEN:** Meeting called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chairman Roberts. A quorum exists.

PZ Director – Cynda Herrick:	Present
PZ Commissioner – Brad Mabe	Present
PZ Commissioner – Ben Oyarzo:	Present
PZ Commissioner – Carrie Potter:	Present
PZ Commissioner – Ken Roberts:	Present
PZ Commissioner – Heidi Schneider:	Excused
PZ Planner II – Lori Hunter:	Present

**B. MINUTES:** Commissioner Potter moved to approve the minutes of October 16, 2025, and October 23, 2025. Commissioner Mabe seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

### C. OLD BUSINESS:

- 1. SUB 25-019 HWY 55 Storage – Preliminary Plat:** Pearson Storage Partners LLC is requesting a conditional use permit for a subdivision on 28.5 acres. Block 1 would include 108 condominium storage units and two offices/bathroom units. Individual septic systems and individual wells are proposed. The use for Block 2 is undefined. Access would be from a joint driveway onto State Highway 55. The site, addressed at 14014 Highway 55, includes parcel RP18N03E331807 and Vandal Flats Subdivision Lot 2 Block 1, located in the NE ¼ Section 33, T.18N, R.3E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. *Tabled from September 11, 2025.* Action Item.

Commissioner Mabe moved to move SUB 25-019 HWY 55 Storage from the table. Commissioner Oyarzo seconded. Motion passed unanimously. Commissioner Potter did not vote.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest. Commissioner Potter recused herself.

Director Herrick presented the staff report, displayed the site, GIS map, and plat on the projector screen, and summarized the following exhibits submitted by the applicant:

- **Exhibit 1** – Revised Preliminary Plat (7 sheets), received November 10, 2025. Vandal Flats Subdivision Lot 2 Block 1 has been removed from the preliminary plat.
- **Exhibit 2** – Revised Landscape Concept, received November 10, 2025

- **Exhibit 3** – Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) pre-screening results received November 10, 2025. Applicant is not required to file with FAA.
- **Exhibit 4** – Renderings of proposed buildings and landscaping received November 10, 2025.
- **Exhibit 5** – Landscape compilation video received November 10, 2025

Director Herrick stated that she has been informed that a construction business has moved to site and two shipping containers that need placement permits are at the site. The applicant should clarify.

Commissioner Mabe inquired if similar requests from Idaho Transportation Department (ITD) are usually met at this time of the application process. Director Herrick responded that condition of approval typically states that ITD approval is required prior to construction. The applicant needs to be working towards this approval.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Rob Pair, Crestline Engineering, McCall, represented the applicant. Additional information requested by Commissioners has been provided. The name was changed to Rocky Mountain Storage due to a conflict with an existing business name. They have been working with staff, ITD, a traffic engineer, and Lake Irrigation District. Following the September PZ Commission meeting, applicant's representatives met with ITD. Their initial feedback indicated that a traffic study would need completed prior to submitting an application to ITD. The team then consulted with a private traffic engineer who will prepare a traffic study to be submitted to ITD. The company has prepared a scoping study and a trip generation analysis which has been submitted to ITD. Traffic counts to provide baseline traffic volumes are ongoing. Trip generation at full buildout for Rocky Mountain storage is anticipated to be equivalent to approximately 12 single family residences. Other adjacent developments such as McCall Landing and Paradigm Storage, which include 19 single-family homes and 121 storage condominiums, have been approved for access by Valley County and ITD. The 105 storage condominiums in Rocky Mountain Storage will generate less trips. Once this analysis is complete and the final report is furnished, we should expect an answer from ITD in or around January 2026. Staff has proposed Conditions of Approval 10 and 21 which establish the requirements for access and use through ITD. The applicant will adhere to ITD requirements.

More detailed renderings of proposed landscaping have been submitted. The video compilation was played on the large screen (**Exhibit 5**). The renderings reflect the updated landscape plan and include the proposed pond, berms, trees, rock, shrubbery, and snow fencing. Questions regarding the existing irrigation ditch were raised at the September PZ Commission meeting. Since then, Mr. Pair attended the Lake Irrigation District board meeting. There was discussion of the need for an easement to be placed over the ditch for access and maintenance. Lake Irrigation District did not make a decision at the board meeting and wished to look further into the matter. Mr. Pair expects the next Lake Irrigation District meeting to occur on the second Tuesday in December. If an easement is required, one will be included on the final plat. Another option would be to reference language specific to Idaho code on the plat. The applicant has no issues with allowing monitoring of the first well installed at the site.

Mr. Pair responded to questions from Commissioners. Commissioner Mabe appreciated the additional information. However, the very long plain brown metal building will be visible even with berms. Can the applicant design the building to be more interesting, particularly as Highway 55 is designated a Scenic Byway? Mr. Pair stated he would defer questions regarding the design to the applicant; berms and landscaping are intended to improve the site.

Dusty Bitton, 14076 Morell Road, recently sold two storage units he owned on Deinhardt Lane; the two shipping containers at the site are currently being used to store these items. Some stuff is being moved into the existing storage unit building now. He will be building some mezzanines in the back for future owners. Scaffolding, saws, and other things are being unloaded from the shipping containers for this construction. Then the shipping containers will be moved to the Rocky Mountain Crane yard.

The new storage units would be two-toned like the existing building, black on the bottom, brown on top, black fascia, and a black roof. A couple of storage units have already been lost by breaking up the front solid building into two buildings. The opening will be used to assist in snow removal. The front buildings also provided screening of the interior of the project from Highway 55. The lower, 18-ft high eave side of the building will be along Highway 55.

Mr. Bitton clarified that a well would not be dug specifically for monitoring by Idaho Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ). However, when the first well is dug, he will let DEQ install monitoring equipment in the well.

There was further discussion between Mr. Bitton and the Commissioners regarding the ditch, easement, and building design. The ditch is 100% within the wetland area, winds in and out along the property line. Buildings would not interfere with the ditch. The ditch is currently not maintained; it enters the property on the northeast corner. Chairman Roberts stated that any water conveyance must have access for maintenance. Mr. Bitton stated he had no issues with giving an easement; he is not planning on moving or piping or doing anything that would obstruct the waterway. Commission Mabe asked if he was willing to modify the building design. Mr. Bitton replied he should not be asked to do more than anyone else has had to do. It is a nice-looking building. There are already multiple steel buildings along Highway 55. Paradigm Storage across Highway 55 is already selling storage units and has installed no landscaping yet. Mr. Bitton would add mature trees to the site as part of the landscaping. Commissioner Mabe stated that Idaho Waterworks has a visually pleasing metal building; Mr. Bitton countered that there is no screening to the five 200-ft by 300-ft metal buildings from Highway 55 at that site. Chairman Roberts cautioned that the application is being considered on its own merits and not compared to previously approved applications.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none.  
Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none.  
Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. Commissioners would like to see the results of the traffic impact study and also hear further from Lake Irrigation District.

Commissioner Mabe moved to table the conditional use permit and preliminary plat for SUB 25-019 to February 12, 2025, at 6:00 p.m. Commissioner Oyarzo seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

There is a 10-day appeal period to the Board of County Commissioners in accordance with Valley County Code 9-5H-12.

*6:34 p.m.*

- 2. C.U.P. 25-023 Restoration Pro:** Matthew Evans is requesting a conditional use permit for the office and equipment storage of a business. An individual well and individual septic system would be used. Access is from both Highway 55 and Garden Lane, a public road. The 1-acre parcel, addressed at 13995 Highway 55, is in the NWSE Section 33, T.18N, R.3E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. *Tabled from October 16, 2025.* Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Commissioner Potter moved to remove C.U.P. 25-023 Restoration Pro from the table; Commissioner Oyarzo seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

Director Herrick presented the staff report, displayed the updated site, GIS map, and site plan on the projector screen, and summarized the following exhibits:

- **Exhibit 1** – Applicant submitted revised drawings and site plan; received November 11, 2025.

Direct access to Highway 55 has been removed from the site plan and the parking area has been revised. The site shows two accesses onto Garden Lane with a berm between. A stormwater management plan would be required to keep drainage from ditch (proposed COA #6). A sign would be allowed on the property and one on a structure.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Matthew Evans, 13995 Highway 55, since the previous meeting, he found the property pins, ran string lines, and measured all setbacks to create a "to scale" site plan. The parking area would include four (4) pickups pulling standard work trailers. Mr. Evans spoke about parking, setbacks, and a future shop. He does not have current plans to build the shop, but would want a new shop if business expands. He will meet landscaping requirements. Current proposal is shown in **Exhibit 1**. There would be no retail nor customers on site. The house would be used as an office.

Chairman Roberts clarified that an increase in scope, such as additional vehicles, would require an amended conditional use permit and could be approved or denied by a future PZ Commission.

Mr. Evans is willing to limit access only to Garden Lane and then to Highway 55, without using Rustic Lane. The driveway is approximately 100-ft from Highway 55. He understands concerns from neighbor to the south.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none.  
Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none.  
Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. Commissioners appreciated the detailed, to-scale drawings submitted in **Exhibit 1**. Additional conditions of approval were discussed based on new information from applicant.

Commissioner Mabe moved to approve C.U.P. 25-023 Restoration Pro with the stated conditions.

**COA:** Maximum of four (4) pickup-truck/trailer and six (6) employee vehicles.

**COA:** Access from Garden Lane directly to Highway 55 only.

**COA:** No retail at the site.

Commissioner Potter seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

There is a 10-day appeal period to the Board of County Commissioners in accordance with Valley County Code 9-5H-12.

6:55 p.m.

- 3. SUB 25-018 Tripod View - Preliminary Plat:** Steven Emerson is requesting a conditional use permit for a 12-lot, single-family residential subdivision on 46 acres. Proposed lot sizes range from 1.8-acres to 4.2 acres. Individual septic systems and individual wells are proposed. The lots would be accessed from a new private road onto Dry Buck Road, a public road. Variances are requested for shared driveways and a cul-de-sac road longer than 900-ft. The site is part of parcels RP1ON02E130606 and RP1ON02E131915 located in the NE ¼ Section 13, T.10N, R.2E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. Tabled from October 16, 2025. Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Commissioner Mabe moved to move SUB 25-018 Tripod View from the table. Commissioner Potter seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Director Herrick presented the staff report, displayed the site, GIS map, and plat on the projector screen, and summarized the following exhibits:

- **Exhibit 1** – Neal Capps, Gem County Road and Bridge Department Director, would like to be notified if approved by PZ Commission. He also wishes to be notified of any proposed development application in the High Valley area. (November 12, 2025)
- **Exhibit 2** – Kim Minter, owner of cabin in Marster's Subdivision, is opposed due to negative impacts to traffic, road conditions, and quality of life in High Valley. (November 12, 2025)
- **Exhibit 3** – Barbara McNeil and Harold Miller are opposed due to concerns of adverse impacts to High Valley residents' health and safety, the availability of public services, and wildfire. (November 11, 2025)
- **Exhibit 4** – Art Lee, 2 Lem Court, is opposed due to the road condition and dust from traffic. (November 12, 2025)
- **Exhibit 5** – E. Brian Allen, 175 Wilderness Lake RD, has concerns. He will present testimony this evening. (November 13, 2025)

Director Herrick stated she had responded to Mr. Capps explaining that the subdivision process in Valley County differs from Gem County. Mr. Capps further responded that he was strongly opposed due to access from Gem County and existing road conditions. Director Herrick clarified to the PZ Commissioners that during the winter, access from Smith's Ferry is closed due to snow. There was discussion between Staff and Commissioners on noticing, impacts to, and comments from adjacent Counties. A condition of approval could require the applicant work with Gem County for their impacts; however, Valley County cannot require them to pay impact fees to Gem County and should not require approval from Gem County. Valley County would have no control over another County's decisions or demands. The section of road from Gem County was reviewed on the GIS map; Gem County could stop maintaining the section of road. From Ola to the Valley County line is approximately eight road miles. It is the only plowed road access in the winter; other options are available during the summer.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Steven Emerson, Star, Idaho, apologized for angst of the public that was unintentionally created. He acknowledged the letter from Gem County Road and Bridge. He would not be opposed to participating in a cost-share for road maintenance. Mr. Emerson responded to previous comments from Commissioners and the public. He intends to operate a working

ranch; this proposal is to raise capital to improve the ranch and continue to raise cattle and grow timber. The location of the proposed subdivision was chosen due to the least impact to the overall ranch operations. Trees at this site are not thick enough to have timber value but would be of value to future lot owners. The subdivision would preserve the overall value of ranch property, would have access to public roads, and would not be visible to much of High Valley. The lots would be hidden from the primary traffic in the area. The proposal is consistent with prior use; there are eight adjacent existing residential areas. Mr. Emerson is not a developer, this is the first development he has made, and additional phases are not planned. He used a consultant, James Fronk, for help with lot design and the application process. Mr. Emerson referred to the well log map that he submitted and wells in the area. Depth and water production varies throughout the High Valley area; better water seems to be deeper.

John Lillehaug, McCall, spoke about the Wildland Urban Interface Fire Protection Plan (WUIPP) he created. Roughly 400 acres of Mr. Emerson's 640-acre property is in timber; the rest is open grazing land with grass, sagebrush, and scattered trees. The property has been thinned and is good shape as far as wildfire risk is concerned. A wildfire would not be expected to spread too fast or get up into the crowns easily as fuel loading has been reduced. Approximately half of the proposed subdivision is 100% forested; other half is open sagebrush and grass with strings of trees. Access onto Dry Buck Road is from a private road. This road is currently native surface that provides easement access to adjacent properties. The road will be reconstructed to meet private road standards. The dead-end road would have appropriate turn arounds for fire suppression apparatus. A perennial Class 2 stream, with no fish, on the east end of property flows into Little Squaw Creek. Both the pond at the private road entrance and the pond located north of the proposed subdivision are shallow and not suitable for a dry hydrant for fire suppression purposes. There are a lot of water sources throughout High Valley that can provide water for fire suppression.

The WUIPP contains three vegetation treatments to minimize fire risk for the subdivision and adjacent properties. (1) The property is currently grazed and would continue to be so until lots are sold; grazing reduces fire risk. Grazing could continue if new lot owner(s) is willing; lot owners would be responsible to fence cows out. (2) A shaded fuel break would be created along the new private road, 20 to 30-ft wide where feasible. Young, smaller trees would be spaced a minimum of 12-ft apart. Lower limbs would be pruned while leaving 40% of the crown. Larger trees would be spaced 20 to 25-ft apart and limbs would be pruned 8-10-ft high. This would reduce likelihood of a crown fire. Slash/debris would be disposed of properly. (3) New lot owners would construct driveways and building sites. Lots would be required to have same shaded fuel break specifications as the private road. Lots would also require:

- Firewise defensive space zones with hard landscaping or irrigated green grass by buildings in the Immediate Zone.
- Fire resistant plants in the Intermediate Zone. Ponderosa Pine and Douglas Fir are considered fire resistant when lower limbs are pruned. Propane tanks would be placed on gravel or concrete pads a minimum of 30 ft from structures.
- Trees can be closer within the Extended Zone.

These requirements would reduce fuels, provide safety for ingress/egress, and minimize risk of wildfire. There is no fire district in this area. Property owners will need to take responsibility using right building materials. These restrictions can be addressed by CCRs.

Director Herrick read the second email from Neal Capps, Gem County Road and Bridge Department Director, into the record (**Exhibit 10**). Mr. Capps is concerned that additional phases may be planned. The High Valley Road is steep, narrow, and winding road with limited site distances. Additional traffic volumes would increase the wear and maintenance on a road that is already difficult due to terrain and weather conditions. Should the County approve this subdivision, the applicant should be responsible for roadway improvements to include but not

limited to tree removal, improved site distances, potential widening, and/or addition of surface material on High Valley Road.

*Short recess was held to approximately 7:40 p.m.*

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none. Chairman Roberts asked for undecided.

E. Brian Allen, 175 Wilderness Lake Road, submitted **Exhibit 5**. He referred to the picture he submitted of a road sign posted at the intersection of Dry Buck RD and Old Buck RD. This sign states that the road is closed one mile ahead, local traffic only. Mr. Allen questioned if this sign makes the road private after one mile; he would like a legal determination. He also wants clarification to make sure the posting notice met required Code. He is concerned about additional traffic on High Valley Road. High Valley Road to Smith's Ferry is normally a good road. From the T-Junction to Ola, the road gets destroyed by current traffic and logging trucks. Every spring, the road base is pushed up towards surface.

Chairman Roberts asked for opponents.

John Kinney, Boise, submitted well data (**Exhibit 7**), including well location, depth, soil type, and production. His well is labeled "A" and is located at 141 Dry Buck Road, just south of the proposed site. The four closest wells to the site, labeled A, B, and C, produce 1, 1, and 3 gallons per minute. Adding 12 more wells at this site is a concern. He was curious if a test well has been done on the proposed subdivision site.

John Green, a full-time resident at 137 Dry Buck Road, submitted (**Exhibit 8**). The new road would go right past his barn. The pond cannot be used for fire mitigation; that was previously attempted during a fire. The closest fire station is located in Ola, a half-hour to 45 minutes away. This proposal would eliminate the grazing that currently occurs on his property. His well provides about a half-hour supply, less than 200 gallons in a half-hour, before the well starts pumping sand. **Exhibit 8** shows watersheds and streams located on the proposed site. These areas provide wetlands and wildlife habitat for animals such as sandhill cranes. Even with mitigation there will be fire concerns. The Cascade Fire Chief did not support the proposal.

Jennifer Hunn, Boise, submitted written and verbal testimony (**Exhibit 6**). The surrounding property is rural land and dry grazing land. The site is cut off from Valley County services, schools, libraries, medical centers, grocery stores, hardware stores, etc., five to six months of the year. There is no mail or garbage service. Average response time for EMS in the last year was 67 minutes. Fire service can come from Ola. The last neighborhood developed in the area was Wilderness Lake Ranch in the late 1990s. Adding new lots would set a precedent. There would be impacts to wildlife. The new septic tanks would drain toward the wetland area. She disagrees with James Fronk's wetland delineation, particularly during snow melt and spring runoff. Development should occur where infrastructure exists. This proposal would not create affordable long-term housing. Impacts to roads are a concern. The existing four adjacent parcels have less than 4,000-sqft of buildings; the proposal would add 31,000 to 75,000-sqft of building space.

Tom Love, a full-time resident at 120 High Valley Road for about six years, primary concern is public safety. This includes response time to emergencies, particularly during winter. During 2024, it took four hours for a wildland fire crew to arrive to a wildfire in the High Valley area. Other concerns include impacts to existing wells, traffic, and road conditions.

Susan Brown, Boise and 137 Dry Buck Road, submitted a letter from Connie Baker, the previous property owner of the proposed subdivision site (**Exhibit 9**). The well on Susan Brown's adjacent property lasts 30 minutes and water quality varies. There is not enough water to irrigate a yard. Her septic tank is too close to a stream (125-ft) that runs three to four months per year; thus, she was only allowed gray water use. Cascade Fire District does not recommend approval of the subdivision. There is no more active ranger station or fire suppression group in the area. The ranch's cattle currently graze on her property. If the grazing stops, her property taxes would increase. The proposal would adversely affect the environment and wildlife habitat.

Jessie Perkins, 120 Wilderness Lake Road, is opposed.

Saul Monreal, Nampa and Dry Buck Road, is the fifth generation that homesteaded the area. Concerns include fire, road conditions, water, wildlife, and waterfowl habitat. The proposal would negatively change the community.

Blane Wheatley, Meridian and 18 Woodall Lane, asked if this proposal was the first phase of development. He is concerned that the proposed fire suppression uses water from ponds and streams located off-site. This may impact the water rights of others.

Jeff Bayes, 13 Ranch Circle, is concerned about the correspondence from Gem County Road and Bridge Department. Better communication between Valley County and Gem County is needed. Gem County maintains the High Valley Road for approximately six months of the year.

Sam Penrod, 175 Lantern Way, moved to the area in 2024 for retirement. He wanted a rural area, not subdivision projects. This would negatively impact the High Valley Area and the reasons that people choose to own land in the area.

Chairman Roberts asked for rebuttal from the applicant.

Steve Emerson stated valid concerns have been expressed, particularly regarding road and fire safety. Mr. Capps assumed additional developments were planned; this is incorrect. Mr. Emerson intends to run cattle on the ranch, not create multiple developments. Regarding the reference to water in High Valley area for fire suppression, the fire consultant was responding to comments asking where water could be used by helicopters responding to wildfire.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated.

Chairman Roberts has concerns regarding limited supply of domestic drinking water in the area. If existing wells are negatively impacted by new wells, there are provisions in Idaho Code for protection.

Commissioner Potter expressed concerns regarding wells, EMS and fire response, safety of community, and the public testimony of road conditions and seasonal availability.

Commissioner Mabe also has concerns regarding water. If existing wells run dry, there is a process to follow with the State of Idaho. The fire mitigation plan is robust. Mitigation efforts would greatly reduce although not eliminate fire concerns. People attracted to rural areas understand the risks and long response times for emergency services. The existing road conditions are not due to residential traffic but by logging trucks. It is a horrible and narrow road in the winter. These are things that property purchasers need to consider. People buying in this



area are likely to be more self-reliant individualists. The comments regarding a decrease in the general quality of life due to additional people are occurring throughout Idaho. How to mitigate while upholding private property rights is a tough discussion.

Commissioner Oyarzo stated that the water supply, both for domestic wells and fire suppression, is his primary concern.

Chairman Roberts referred to the previous discussion on use of ponds for dry hydrants; however, testimony has been given that the ponds would not work for fire suppression. There is no guarantee that grazing would continue under future lot owners. The lack of grazing is a future fire concern. If the Commission was to approve this subdivision, there would need to be a conditional of approval requiring an agreement with Gem County regarding road mitigation. However, this Commission does not have control over another jurisdiction. It is unclear if the Road Superintendent's comments are the official opinion of Gem County. Cascade Fire Chief recommends denial.

There was further discussion between Commissioners of a possible agreement with Gem County. Idaho Transportation Department is also a different jurisdiction outside of this Commission's control.

Chairman Roberts stated the Valley County Prosecuting Attorney has stated that health, safety, and welfare are reasons that the Commission can deny applications. Chairman Roberts has serious concerns about health and safety of this proposal.

Commissioner Mabe stated it is the right of people to accept that risk. Residential traffic is not causing High Valley Road issues. There needs to be something on road maintenance although he is unsure of how to word the condition of approval requiring the landowner to work with Gem County. Requiring the applicant to reach an agreement may be beyond the Commission's scope.

Director Herrick stated the condition could read as "Shall work with Gem County to address their proportional share of impacts." If Gem County has traffic count numbers, the impact of the 12 proposed lots would be compared to the impacts of existing lots plus recreational use plus logging trucks. This would be considered in development agreement with the Board of County Commissioners. Director Herrick did reach out today to Jeff McFadden, Valley County Road Superintendent. The major road to Warren and Secesh is in Valley County. However, Idaho County does not assist with road maintenance unless Idaho County specifically asks the road to be opened in the winter. Director Herrick believes road impacts would be a discussion between the Valley County Commissioners and Gem County Commissioners.

Chairman Roberts stated another condition of approval would be to require the applicant to drill a community well to prove adequate water supply exists for 12 new homes as determined by the Idaho Department of Water Resources. This would consider the health and safety of new lot owners. Commissioner Potter stated that this would be a great compromise.

Chairman Roberts also stated a 10,000-gallon water tank for fire suppression should be required. He questions if there is any water source less than two or three miles away from the site. At some point in time, the community will be motivated to create a fire district.

Commissioner Oyarzo stated that water tanks do no good if the pumping equipment is not available.

Commissioner Mabe understands why the Cascade Fire District did not recommend approval. The site is outside of the fire district; however, much of private land in Valley County is outside of a fire district. This should not become a requirement.

There was further discussion. Yellow Pine has a fire brigade as does Silver Springs. Chairman Roberts questions if the Commission has enough information to make a decision. Is there enough water? A condition requiring a test well would gather information. This proposal is for 12 houses in 40 acres; is the distance and topography between a community well and individual homes feasible? Director Herrick asked for clarification if the Commissioners want (1) proof that water exists or (2) a community well for all 12 homes. Commissioner Mabe stated he would support a test well to determine if water is available. Chairman Roberts stated his intent is for the applicant to prove that there is enough water for all 12 lots using one well which may need to be much deeper than other wells in the area.

Commissioner Mabe moved to approve the conditional use permit and preliminary plat for SUB 25-018 Tripod View with the stated conditions.

**COA:** Shall work with Gem County to address their proportional share of impacts as part of a development agreement. Recommend the Valley County Board of Commissioners discuss with Gem County Commissioners.

Commissioner Potter seconded the motion. Commissioner Potter and Commissioner Mabe voted in favor of the motion; Commission Oyarzo and Chairman Roberts voted in opposition. The motion was denied.

There is a 10-day appeal period to the Board of County Commissioners in accordance with Valley County Code 9-5H-12.

8:42 p.m.

#### **D. NEW BUSINESS:**

- 1. VAC 25-002 Trumpour Vacation of Easement:** Lynda Trumpour is requesting vacation of a 10-ft easement that is centered on the lot line between Round Valley Snow Haven No. 2 Lots 10 and 11 in order to build over the easements. The 1.36-acre site is addressed at 135 Skidoo Place and located in SWSW Section 21, T.12N, R.4E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Director Herrick presented the staff report and displayed the site and GIS map on the projector screen. Director Herrick clarified that the applicant owns both lots.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Chris Sage, 144 Herrick Lane, representing his mother, the applicant. The best spot to build is over the lot line, on top of the hill. This location also makes sense for electrical power. location of existing power location.

Director Herrick stated that the lots must be combined to build over the lot lines.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none. Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none. Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. Commissioners concurred that the application is straightforward and there were no concerns. No concerns were raised by agencies nor the public.

Commissioner Potter moved to recommend approval of VAC 25-002 Trumpour Vacation of Easement to the Board of County Commissioners. Commissioner Mabe seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously. This matter will be forwarded to the Board of County Commissioners for a final decision.

*8:48 p.m.*

**2. C.U.P. 25-027 Alzar School Staff Housing:** Alzar School INC is requesting a conditional use permit for 8 additional staff residences. An individual well and individual septic systems would be used. The homes would be accessed from Airport Way, a public road. The 80-acre parcel RP13N04E082406 is in the NW ¼ Section 8, T.13N, R.4E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Director Herrick presented the staff report and displayed the site, GIS map, and site plan on the projector screen.

Director Herrick referred to staff comments in the staff report regarding frontage. Upon further review, the frontage is actually allowed due to frontage on Airport Way within the City of Cascade that exists within the adjacent property owned by the applicant.

Director Herrick clarified that an approval of this application is not approval of any other land use on this parcel or any other parcel owned by Alzar School.

Director Herrick and Commissioners discussed the application further. The proposed landscaping is typical residential landscaping around homes. Alzar School is not on the City of Cascade sewer system. Alzar School previously applied for annexation into Cascade and was denied.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

T.J. Wilcomb, Boise, represented the applicant. Sean Bierle of Alzar School is also available via speaker phone from South America. Eight homes are proposed over approximately 10 years. The plan is to start with a 3-bedroom home and a 2-bedroom home. The remainder would be completed by 2035. Homes would have a metal roof.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none. Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none. Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. Commissioners agreed that the application is straightforward with little impact on other property owners. The proposal is consistent with the Valley County Comprehensive Plan.

Commissioner Mabe moved to approve C.U.P. 25-027 Alzar School Staff Housing with the stated conditions. Commissioner Potter seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

There is a 10-day appeal period to the Board of County Commissioners in accordance with Valley County Code 9-5H-12.

8:58 p.m.

**3. VAR 25-001 Vaughn Variance from Building Envelope:** Larry Vaughn is requesting a variance to build outside of the platted building envelope. The 3.06-acre site, addressed 28 Compass Lane, is 360° Ranch Subdivision Phase 1 Lot 7 Block 2, in the W ½ Section 28, T.18N, R.3E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Director Herrick presented the staff report, displayed the site and GIS map on the projector screen, and summarized the following exhibits:

- **Exhibit 1** – The applicant submitted three images of the site plan and building envelope. Proposed home is slightly outside the building envelope. A shop would be built on the east side of property. (November 10, 2025)
- **Exhibit 2** – The applicant submitted information explaining the request. (November 12, 2025)
- **Exhibit 3** – The applicant submitted mailing information of the two adjoining property owners and an image of a shop similar to the proposed building. (November 12, 2025)

Director Herrick and Commissioners discussed the proposed site plan and platted building envelope. The homeowner association does not have concerns and is support of the applicants. Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) Form 7460.1 will be required prior to building permits for all buildings, not just the home. Only a few lots in this subdivision have been built on. Other building permits within the subdivision have been within the building envelopes. The building envelopes were platted to control building height due to the typical airplane flight pattern at the site. Emily Hart, McCall Airport Manager, stated a hardship does not exists to support a variance.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Larry and Kathy Vaughn, Meridian, referred to **Exhibit 2**. The hardship created is the position and shape of the building envelope. The FAA's concern is the height of structures. The subdivision CCRs require personal items to be garaged. They own various vehicles, recreational toys, and equipment that will be stored in the shop. The FAA Form 7460.1 has been submitted form; however, review is delayed due to the ongoing government shutdown. This lot has a maximum elevation of 5,129-ft as set by the FAA. The proposed building height would be 24-ft below the maximum allowed. Approving the variance would not create a hazard to air navigation.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none.  
Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none.  
Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. Chairman Roberts stated the applicant must follow FAA standards. The homeowner association approves of the variance, and no one is here to testify against. Commissioner Mabe stated a variance for the home seems minimal, but the shop would be quite a ways outside the platted building envelope. He would expect other lots to make a similar request. The rationale of the building envelopes was discussed. The building envelopes were platted to locate building sites based upon elevation and building height. It was not to create viewsheds. Each building envelope includes a maximum building elevation. Commissioner Mabe stated that approval of this variance would not appear to change risk variables to air traffic.

Commissioner Mabe moved to recommend approval of VAR 25-001 Vaughn Variance from Building Envelope to the Board of County Commissioners. Commissioner Potter seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously. This matter will be forwarded to the Board of County Commissioners for a final decision.

9:15 p.m.

- 4. C.U.P. 25-028 Smith Short-Term Rental:** Todd Smith is requesting a conditional use permit for the short-term rental of an accessory dwelling unit (ADU 2022-12). This 625-sqft residence is above the detached garage. The property owners would reside in the main residence. An individual well is used; North Lake Recreational Sewer and Water District provides sewer services. The 0.9-acre site, addressed at 22 Norwood Place, is The Woods on Norwood Lot 3 located in the NW ¼ Section 16, T.16N, R.3E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Director Herrick presented the staff report and displayed the site, GIS map, and site plan on the projector screen.

The home is on sewer system, not an individual septic system. Commissioners and Staff discussed the proposed number of guests and vehicles, quiet hours, parking, and setbacks.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Todd Smith, 22 Norwood Place, stated he proposed 12 vehicles. The ADU is a residence above the detached garage. He lives in the primary residence. The driveway is large enough to accommodate both his vehicles and those of renters. He will be managing the short-term rental. Most houses on this street are short-term rentals. Unlike the nearby homes, he has an additional residential unit. He created a loop driveway as it allows for turnaround areas for U.S. Postal Service and emergency vehicles. Mr. Smith has four to five vehicles at the home and also uses the garage.

Commissioners, Staff, and Mr. Smith discussed parking, number of vehicles, and addressing of the rental unit.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none.

Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. The site should be limited to four vehicles for rental guests. The application was straightforward.

Commissioner Mabe moved to approve C.U.P. 25-028 Smith Short-Term Rental with the stated conditions.

**COA:** Shall limit vehicles associated with short-term renters to a maximum of four (4).

Commissioner Potter seconded the motion. There was discussion that short-term rental of Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs) is not necessarily appropriate in all neighborhoods. The Commissioners considered the high number of existing short-term rental homes in the neighborhood. Another reason for approval of this application is that the applicant lives on site and will be available if issues arise. The Commissioners did not recommend a development agreement. The motion carried unanimously.

There is a 10-day appeal period to the Board of County Commissioners in accordance with Valley County Code 9-5H-12.

9:30 p.m.

- 5. C.U.P. 25-029 Yellow Pine Fuel Station:** Connell Oil INC and CO-Energy are requesting a conditional use permit for fuel tanks and pumps. Fuel would be available to the public for purchase. Access would be from Yellow Pine Ave and Ellison ST, both public roads. The 0.17-acre parcel, addressed at 320 Yellow Pine Ave, is Townsite of Yellow Pine Lot 14 Block D in the SWSW Section 21, T.19N, R.8E, Boise Meridian, Valley County, Idaho. Action Item.

Chairman Roberts introduced the item and asked if there was any exparte contact or conflict of interest; there was none. Director Herrick presented the staff report, displayed the site, GIS map, and site plan on the projector screen, and summarized the following exhibits:

- **Exhibit 1** – Lorinne Munn supports the proposal. (November 11, 2025)

The PZ Commission previously determined that a conditional use permit was necessary to return fuel tanks to this site. There was discussion on the previous tanks on the site; previously buried tanks have been removed.

Chairman Roberts asked for the applicant's presentation.

Brad Bell of CO Energy, Boise, stated the proposal is for a 12,000-gallon, fire-rated, double-walled tank with three compartments for premium, unleaded, and diesel fuel. Card-readers would be used for purchase. There would be turbine pumps with electronic dispensers. The power source is electric; a generator may be added for back-up power. A dry slab would contain spills or drips. Bulkheads will protect the tank from vehicles. The company has six other sites that are similar in Washinton and Idaho. He has been in business for over 38 years. The Yellow Pine blog had 23 positive comments.

Chairman Roberts opened the public hearing and asked for proponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts asked for undecided. There were none.

Chairman Roberts asked for opponents. There were none.

Chairman Roberts closed the public hearing. The Commission deliberated. There is currently no fuel available for purchase by the public in the Yellow Pine area. This proposal would fill a critical need in the Yellow Pine community.

Commissioner Mabe moved to approve C.U.P. 25-029 Yellow Pine Fuel Station with the stated conditions. Commissioner Potter seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

There is a 10-day appeal period to the Board of County Commissioners in accordance with Valley County Code 9-5H-12.

9:43 p.m.

**E. OTHER:**

- 1. Is a subdivision plat required to split parcel RP16N02E128626 or is the parcel eligible to be split into two pieces divided by No Business Road? Action Item.**

Staff and Commissioners discussed the request and property. The 18.6-acre property is split by No Business Road. The owner would like to have the property recognized as two separate parcels as it is split by a major, well-used public road. The property was deeded within the same deed.

Commissioner Mabe moved to recognize a parcel split on the two pieces as divided by No Business Road and create two buildable parcels, one on each side of the road. Commissioner Potter seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

**2. C.U.P. 24-28 Ore and Husk Office and Warehouse: Does obtaining a building permit adequately meet the condition of approval requiring use to be established by October 22, 2025? Action Item.**

A condition use permit was previously approved for automobile sales at 11 Pearson Lane. Director Herrick stated the use has not been established and the applicant did not apply for an extension. The applicant has paid for a building permit but has not started construction. The Valley County Building official stated a “stop work” order would be done. There was discussion on what establishes the use; Valley County Code does not define this. The Commissioners agreed that obtaining a building permit but not starting construction does not equal establishing the use. The Commission has encouraged longer time frames and project phasing. The cleanest way to fix this is for the applicant to reapply. The cost of an extension and an application is the same. Both would require public hearings.

Commissioner Mabe moved to require that the applicant reapply for a new conditional use permit and ask for an extension for the building permit. Commissioner Potter seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

**F. FACTS AND CONCLUSIONS - Action Items:**

- VAC 25-001 Zrile Vacation of Utility Easements
- C.U.P. 25-022 Paikka Bakery - Amendment of C.U.P. 22-13
- C.U.P. 25-024 North Fork Championship
- C.U.P. 25-025 Intermountain Sports Rentals and Repair
- SUB 25-017 Moss Landing
- Revisions to Valley County Comprehensive Plan and Valley County Code

Commissioner Potter moved to approve the Facts and Conclusions as presented and authorize the chairman to sign. Commissioner Oyarzo seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Chairman Roberts adjourned the meeting at 9:55 p.m.