



Valley County Transmittal
Division of Community and Environmental Health

Return to:

- ☐ Cascade
☐ Donnelly
☐ McCall
☐ McCall Impact
☒ Valley County

Rezone # _____
Conditional Use # PUD 23-01 Garnet Valley
Preliminary / Final / Short Plat CUP 23-10

- ☐ 1. We have No Objections to this Proposal.
- ☐ 2. We recommend Denial of this Proposal.
- ☐ 3. Specific knowledge as to the exact type of use must be provided before we can comment on this Proposal.
- ☐ 4. We will require more data concerning soil conditions on this Proposal before we can comment.
- ☐ 5. Before we can comment concerning individual sewage disposal, we will require more data concerning the depth of:
☐ high seasonal ground water ☐ waste flow characteristics
☐ bedrock from original grade ☐ other _____
- ☐ 6. This office may require a study to assess the impact of nutrients and pathogens to receiving ground waters and surface waters.
- ☐ 7. This project shall be reviewed by the Idaho Department of Water Resources concerning well construction and water availability.
- ☒ 8. After written approvals from appropriate entities are submitted, we can approve this proposal for:
☒ central sewage ☐ community sewage system ☐ community water well
☐ interim sewage ☒ central water
☐ individual sewage ☐ individual water
- ☒ 9. The following plan(s) must be submitted to and approved by the Idaho Department of Environmental Quality:
☒ central sewage ☐ community sewage system ☐ community water
☐ sewage dry lines ☒ central water
- ☐ 10. Run-off is not to create a mosquito breeding problem
- ☐ 11. This Department would recommend deferral until high seasonal ground water can be determined if other considerations indicate approval.
- ☐ 12. If restroom facilities are to be installed, then a sewage system MUST be installed to meet Idaho State Sewage Regulations
- ☐ 13. We will require plans be submitted for a plan review for any:
☐ food establishment ☐ swimming pools or spas ☐ child care center
☐ beverage establishment ☐ grocery store
- ☒ 14. Application, Engineering report, and approval letters required.

Reviewed By: EHR

Date: 5/9/23



Valley County Transmittal
Division of Community and Environmental Health

Return to:

- ☐ Cascade
☐ Donnelly
☐ McCall
☐ McCall Impact
☒ Valley County

Rezone # PUD 23-1
Conditional Use # CUP 2310
Preliminary / Final / Short Plat Gannet Valley Sub

- ☐ 1. We have No Objections to this Proposal.
- ☐ 2. We recommend Denial of this Proposal.
- ☐ 3. Specific knowledge as to the exact type of use must be provided before we can comment on this Proposal.
- ☐ 4. We will require more data concerning soil conditions on this Proposal before we can comment.
- ☐ 5. Before we can comment concerning individual sewage disposal, we will require more data concerning the depth of:
☐ high seasonal ground water ☐ waste flow characteristics
☐ bedrock from original grade ☐ other _____
- ☐ 6. This office may require a study to assess the impact of nutrients and pathogens to receiving ground waters and surface waters.
- ☐ 7. This project shall be reviewed by the Idaho Department of Water Resources concerning well construction and water availability.
- ☒ 8. After written approvals from appropriate entities are submitted, we can approve this proposal for:
☒ central sewage ☐ community sewage system ☐ community water well
☐ interim sewage ☒ central water
☐ individual sewage ☐ individual water
- ☒ 9. The following plan(s) must be submitted to and approved by the Idaho Department of Environmental Quality:
☒ central sewage ☐ community sewage system ☐ community water
☐ sewage dry lines ☒ central water
- ☐ 10. Run-off is not to create a mosquito breeding problem
- ☐ 11. This Department would recommend deferral until high seasonal ground water can be determined if other considerations indicate approval.
- ☐ 12. If restroom facilities are to be installed, then a sewage system MUST be installed to meet Idaho State Sewage Regulations.
- ☐ 13. We will require plans be submitted for a plan review for any:
☐ food establishment ☐ swimming pools or spas ☐ child care center
☐ beverage establishment ☐ grocery store
- ☒ 14. Application and Engineering Report Required.

Reviewed By: [Signature]

Date: 3/14/23



North Lake Recreational Sewer and Water District
435 South Eld Ln., PO Box 729 Donnelly, ID 83615 (208) 325-8958

March 14th, 2023

Cynda Herrick, Valley County Planning and Zoning Director
Valley County Planning and Zoning Department
PO Box 1350
Cascade, Idaho 83611

Re: P.U.D. 23-01 Garnet Valley, CUP 23-10 Preliminary Plat
April 20th, 2023
Planning and Zoning Public Hearing

Director Herrick:

North Lake Recreational Sewer and Water District (NLRSD) has received Agency Notification and desire to provide the following written comments:

Annexation:

- 1) The subject property is located within The Meadows at West Mountain Subdivision which was annexed by NLRSD in 2004.
- 2) The owner, Timberline Development LLC, is required to fulfill all requirements and conditions as stated in the 2004 Conditions of Annexation for The Meadows at West Mountain Subdivision.
- 3) Conditions of Annexation require Developer/Owner to connect to the central sewer system.

North Lake Recreational Sewer and Water District Central Sewer Services:

- 1) The proposed PUD/CUP/Preliminary Plat varies from "The Meadows at West Mountain Phase 4, 5 & 6" and therefore the existing Sewer Will Serve commitment to Timberline Development LLC would need to be addressed by NLRSD. The prior Will Serve committed 174 EDU's (Equivalent Dwelling Unit) specifically to Phase 4, 5, and 6 of The Meadows at West Mountain Subdivision. The Valley Meadows PUD/CUP would require District approvals and analysis of existing capacity and wastewater infrastructure.



North Lake Recreational Sewer and Water District

435 South Eld Ln., PO Box 729 Donnelly, ID 83615 (208) 325-8958

- 2) The Meadows at West Mountain Phases 2 & 3 sewer infrastructure was not substantially completed by Timberline Development LLC and therefore no further issuing of sewer commitments can be made until Timberline Development LLC has completed the commitments in accordance with the Conditions of Annexation and the Phase 2 & 3 Meadows Lift Station Project.

In summary, NLRSD is currently committed to serving The Meadows at West Mountain Phases 4-6 with 174 EDU's. The proposed PUD/CUP, at a minimum, would require that Timberline LLC fulfill the requirements of the 2004 Conditions of Annexation, substantially complete the Phase 2 & 3 sewer infrastructure, receive District approvals for additional sewer capacity/EDU's, submit infrastructure design for approvals prior to serving any additional development within The Meadows at West Mountain Subdivision.

Sincerely,

Travis Pryor
NLRSD Manager of District Operations

Enclosures

cc: Board of Directors, North Lake Rec Sewer and Water District



Valley County Road & Bridge

PO Box 672* Cascade, Idaho 83611

Jeff McFadden
Superintendent

jmcfadden@co.valley.id.us
Office * (208)382-7195
Fax * (208)382-7198

C.U.P. 23-10

April 10, 2023

The Valley County Road Dept. was asked to review this CUP and provide comments related to the anticipated impact to the local roads that will be utilized for accessing the proposed subdivision. CUP 23-10 is a preliminary plat submitted by Roseberry Park LLC seeking approval of 324 multi-family units, 10 single-family, community amenities and open space.

County maintained roads that will see increased traffic by the addition of the proposed development if the plat is approved include West Roseberry Road, Norwood Road, Tamarack Falls Road and West Mountain Road. It is expected that transportation services including all season road maintenance, road resurfacing, road rebuilds provided by Valley County Road Dept. will be impacted by the increased traffic.

- Recommendation (1): Dedication of 50' right-of-way to the public for property owned by the developer immediately adjacent to West Roseberry Road. Prior to final plat, the developer agrees to provide an appraisal for the value of the ROW along with a legal description and warranty deed to be recorded with the Valley County clerk.
- Recommendation (2): Mitigate impacts to transportation services on those roads identified above by negotiating with developer payment of road improvement costs attributable to traffic generated by proposed development. The value of the developers proportionate share may be determined by several methods: (1) reference 2023 Capital Improvement Program cost comparisons for the West Roseberry CIP with a predetermined cost per lot contribution by developer; (2) engage a qualified engineering firm to conduct a traffic study based on proposed development to provide recommendation for proportionate share to be attributed to the developer; (3) negotiate in-kind construction credits for immediate road improvements needs that can be mitigated by developer.

Any or all of the above recommendations that are agreeable to the developer should be memorialized in a future voluntary road agreement negotiated between the Valley County Board of County Commissioners, Valley County Road Dept. and developer identifying the value of road improvement costs contributed.

Valley County Road Superintendent

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jeff McFadden", is written over the printed name.

Jeff McFadden



Donnelly Rural Fire Protection District

P.O. Box 1178 Donnelly, Idaho 83615

208-325-8619 Fax 208-325-5081

May 22, 2023

Valley County Planning & Zoning Commission
P.O. Box 1350
Cascade, Idaho 83611

RE: P.U.D. 23-01 Garnet Valley and C.U.P. 23-10 Preliminary Plat

After review, the Donnelly Rural Fire Protection District will require the following.

- All fire apparatus access roads shall be built to Valley County Road Department standards or **Section 503.2 IFC 2018**
- **Section 503.2.1 IFC 2018** Fire apparatus access roads shall have an unobstructed width of not less than 20 feet exclusive of shoulders, except for approved security gates in accordance with Section 503.6, and an unobstructed vertical clearance of not less than 13 feet 6 inches
- **Section 503.4 IFC 2018** Fire apparatus access roads shall not be obstructed in any manner including the parking of vehicles, minimum widths and clearances established in Sections 503.2.1 and 503.2.2 shall be maintained at all times
- **Section 503.4.1 IFC 2018** Traffic calming devices shall be prohibited unless approved by the fire code official
- **Section D107.1 IFC 2018** developments of one- or two- family dwellings where the number of dwellings exceeds 30 shall be provided with two separate and approved fire apparatus access roads
- **Section D107.2 IFC 2018** Where two fire apparatus roads are required, they shall be placed a distance apart equal to, and not less than one-half of the length of the maximum overall diagonal dimension of the property or area to be served. This is measured in a straight line between accesses
- All roads shall be inspected and approved by the DRFPD prior to occupancy
- **Section 507.1 IFC 2018** An approved water supply capable of supplying the required fire flow for fire protection shall be provided to the premises upon which facilities, buildings or portions of buildings are hereafter constructed or moved into or within the jurisdiction
- The required water supply for this development shall be a fire hydrant system. All fire hydrants shall have 5 inch Storz connector installed on the hydrant. Fire hydrants shall be placed every 400 to 600 feet, depending on occupancy classification and capable of providing adequate flow. Redundant power supply and redundant fire pump shall be required

- An engineered drawing of the water system complete with hydrant locations shall be submitted to the Donnelly Rural Fire Protection District for review prior to construction. All fire hydrants shall be installed in accordance with **Section C102.1 IFC 2018**
- The required fire flow for multiple family dwellings shall be 1320 gallons per minute with duration of not less than four hours. The fire flow requirement for commercial non-sprinklered application shall be 2250 gallons per minute for a duration of not less than two hours
- All hydrants shall be flow tested prior to final occupancy
- In accordance with **Section 501.5 IFC 2018** Where fire apparatus access roads or a water supply for fire protection are required to be installed, such protection shall be installed and made serviceable prior to and during the time of construction except where approved alternative methods of protection are provided. Temporary street signs shall be installed at each street intersection where construction of new roadways allows passage by vehicles in accordance with **Section 505.2**
- **Section 903.2.8 IFC 2018** An automatic sprinkler system installed in accordance with **Section 903.3** shall be provided throughout all buildings with a Group R fire area
- Fire alarms shall be installed in accordance with **Section 907.2 IFC 2018**
- A complete set of alarm and sprinkler plans shall be submitted to the Donnelly Rural Fire Protection District for review prior to construction
- **Section 503.7.5 IFC 2018** all buildings shall have a permanently posted address, that shall be placed at each driveway entrance and be visible from both directions of travel along the road. In all cases, the address shall be posted at the beginning of construction and maintained thereafter

Please call 208-325-8619 with any questions.

Jess Ellis



Fire Marshal
Donnelly Fire Department

PUD 23-01 Garnet Valley

Stephanie Hopkins

Tue 3/7/2023 2:46 PM

To: Lori Hunter

Cc: Cynda Herrick; Joe Pachner

1 attachments (131 KB)

GarnetValleySubPrelimReviewComments.pdf;

Thank you, Lori. We'll work on getting documentation from the Meadows at West Mountain for the water system and private streets.

We sent out a notice to the Valley County Soil and Conservation District, the McCall Donnelly School District and the police department to get initial feedback on the project about a month ago. The Valley County Soil and Conservation District replied with the attached comments. I'll forward along anything else we receive just in case you'd like to include in the record.

Let us know if you have any questions or if you need any additional information.

Thanks,

Stephanie Hopkins, MCRP, AICP

Land Planning Manager

KM ENGINEERING

5725 North Discovery Way | Boise, ID 83713



Stephanie Hopkins, MCRP, AICP Sent via email: [REDACTED]

Land Planning Manager

KM ENGINEERING

5725 North Discovery Way | Boise, ID 83713

208.639.6939

Subject: Advance Preliminary Plan Set Review

Proposed Garnet Valley Subdivision

Donnelly Area, Valley County, ID

Dear Ms. Hopkins,

Valley County Soil and Water Conservation District appreciate receiving your preliminary plans and your request for comments on them prior to submitting a formal application to the county. We are supportive of smart growth in the valley ... that which is protective of natural resources and takes into account the beauty and open characteristics of the county, and the harmony of our community in general.

We understand the proposed development is called Garnet Valley Subdivision and it is planned to contain approximately 324 multi-family cluster units and 10 single-family modular home lots. The project is located west of Donnelly and southwest of the intersection of West Roseberry Road and Timberline Drive.

We provided a cursory review and our comments, with reference to where we believe the plans deviate from the intent of Codes/Comprehensive Plan, are provided below for consideration:

1. Public Safety

The main town access road to the proposed subdivision is over the deteriorating and accident-prone "Roseberry Road S-bridge" which is very narrow and eventually needs straitening and widening for a safer passage. Lately, this bridge has been in the local paper newspaper because the bridge was constructed ~6 decades ago as a rural access road to a few mountain homes ... not as an arterial road connecting subdivisions or resorts to town. It is outdated, not properly designed (sight distance alignment nor width) for the current or projected daily traffic loads and it is deteriorating. These are facts that make it a high-risk community safety hazard that should be replaced before adding additional traffic loads. Ref: VCC 9-5-3-D(a), VCC 9-5-3-D2 and Comprehensive Plan Ch 2 goal 1 and Ch 3 goal 1, The Star-News.

The county is currently seeking design alternatives and funding to reduce this hazardous risk. Under current conditions, increasing daily traffic loading from 334 new residential units over this bridge is problematic and would exacerbate the problems. A U.S. Department of Transportation county-by-county study indicated that for Valley County, the average trips per household per day was 4 to 5 trips per day. Thus adding 1336 to 1670 additional trips per day over this hazardous bridge (equivalent to somewhere around 2 vehicles per minute during the prime daytime 12-hour traffic period) and could expose the county, developer, and his engineers to negligence or culpable negligence from future traffic accidents and injuries.

We suggest delaying this high-traffic loading project until after the bridge is replaced.

2. Compatibility of Density

The cluster multi-story density suggested on the plan is more compatible in a city setting and not rural areas of Valley County. We suggest the density be more consistent with the area, specifically not exceeding the density of the adjacent Mangum Circle subdivision. Ref: VVC 9-4-1 & 10-1-5, and Comprehensive Plan Ch 2 goal I & 2 and Ch 3.

Plan sheet PP1.0 includes open-space calculations. So as not to create future confusion with the intent of open-space conditions for code "permanency requirements", areas included in the open-space calculation such as those designated with a circle 1, 2, 13, and 14, should be labeled as "open-space, not for future development". If these areas have future development potential, they should not be included in the open-space calculation. Ref: VCC 9-9-6.

3. Drainage and Wetlands

Drainage in this area is a concern as local residents continue to experience seasonal high-water problems, flooding in crawl-spaces, perched water and localized ponding annually.

Unfortunately, our ability to comment on drainage is limited since the plans lack information regarding wetland delineations, flow conveyance detail, the ability of down-gradient conveyance infrastructure to accommodate new cumulative flow concentrations and impacts to receiving wetlands. Ref: US Clean Water Act, Section 319 and 404, and VCC 9-4-3-4, Comprehensive Plan Chapter 4: Natural Resources Goal I, 5.


The pond outline depicted in Area 13 on the plans, in the headwaters of a wetland, is a special concern and as you know VSWCD prefers detention basins as opposed to retention ponds because of senior water rights, mosquito infestations, child safety, and loss of cold water to impaired Lake Cascade and fish habitat. Also, the pond treatment design criterion of 1/3 of a 2-year event shown on the plan is very small and the pond would be easily overwhelmed in handling both upgradient run-on and accelerated impervious surface onsite runoff pollutants. Because of the drainage issues in the area and the fact that Lake Cascade is a 303(d)-listed impaired waterbody, we suggest this criterion be re-evaluated to include a much larger treatment volume.

4. Ingress and Egress

The plans indicate multi-story unit Ingress and Egress from a private road (Timberline Drive) which we believe is maintained by the Meadows Home Owners Association and assume you will obtain permissions for encroaching on private property. We question the ability of this private collector road to accommodate the additional traffic loading and turn-lane access onto and off of Roseberry Road. In addition, it appears that the 10 modular home lots would access Timberline Drive directly. We recommend further evaluations and option of access directly off Roseberry Rd.

Respectfully,

Valley Soil & Water Conservation District Board of Supervisors



The cursory concerns expressed herein are not exhaustive or all-inclusive and other issues are likely to need attention as this project moves from the preliminary to final stages of development. Other issues of concern might reveal themselves as the application proceeds through the P&Z process.

Again, thank you for allowing us to take a look at these preliminary plans and we hope you consider and incorporate our initial comments into the design for a successful project.

Respectfully Submitted,



Valley Soil & Water Conservation District

209 N Idaho Street

PO Box 580

Cascade, Idaho 83611

Telephone: (208) 382-3317

June 1, 2023

Valley County P&Z Commissioners
c/o Cynda Herrick
219 N. Main St.
Cascade, Idaho 83611

Subject: PUD 23-01 & CUP 23-10
Proposed Garnet Valley Subdivision
Donnelly Area, Valley County, ID

Planning and Zoning Commissioners,

The Valley Soil and Water Conservation District would like to comment on the proposed Garnet Valley development. We have the following concerns:

The design criteria for storm water treatment ("Storm water treatment will be for 1/3 of the 2-year event") is inadequate. Drainage in this area is a concern as local residents experience seasonal flooding and high-water problems. Much of the stormwater infiltrates into the open-space soil and some drains through a wetland to a single culvert pipe under Norwood Road.

We question the applicant's statement "The proposed development will not significantly alter the existing drainage patterns and flows" and feel it is specious.

The application's reference to the old Handbook of Valley County Stormwater Best Management Practices is erroneous. This older handbook was replaced with state minimum BMPs and Valley County Addendum to State Manual.

The plans lack information regarding wetland delineations, flow conveyance detail, pond construction and the ability of down-gradient conveyance infrastructure to accommodate new cumulative developments flow concentrations, and impacts to receiving wetlands, so we have inadequate knowledge to be able to comment. Ref: US Clean Water Act, Section 319 and 404 (VCC 9-5A-1-4), and VCC 9-4-3-4, Comprehensive Plan Chapter 4: Natural Resources Goal 1, 5.

Also, as previously mentioned, the pond treatment design criterion of 1/3 of a 2-year event shown on the plan is very small and the pond would be easily overwhelmed in handling both upgradient run-on and accelerated impervious surface onsite runoff pollutants as the design criteria of 1/3 of a 2-year event is totally inadequate and inconsistent with DEQ stormwater criteria (VCC 9-4-3-4-E).

Because of the drainage issues in the area and the fact that Lake Cascade is a 303(d)-listed impaired waterbody, we suggest this criterion be re-evaluated with the county engineer to include a larger treatment volume. Greater treatment volume would be more beneficial for the wetland, Lake Fork Arm and the lake.

Suburban drainage contributes thermal warming and substantial pollutants including nutrients, suspended solids, litter, oil, grease, metals, pesticides, fertilizers and other pollutants to the waterways. These

contribute to wetland degradation and lake toxic algae growth. This application does not adequately address permanent long-term stormwater pollution prevention issues and direct drainage into "special areas" (i.e. Lake Cascade). A detention (not retention) basin and or "constructed wetland" for stormwater filtration/treatment is needed for this development.

We are also concerned with the tons of environmentally road salt used in the curvy section of the S-bridge adding to the degradation of the Lake Fork Arm of Lake Cascade.

Lake Cascade with its complexity of nutrient problems is impaired for failing to meet Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA's) list of 303(d) water quality standards (primarily phosphorus). The lake has exceeded its natural ecological rebound capacity and currently has no remaining natural resiliency to annual nutrient loading and resulting eutrophication. We cannot put the lake in more jeopardy.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Art Troutner', written over a horizontal line.

Valley Soil & Water Conservation District

Supervisors Art Troutner, Chairman, John Lillehaug Treasurer, Bill Leaf, Colt Brown, Judy Anderson
Associates Lenard Long and Pam Pace